

## 2.0 Description of Alternatives

This chapter describes the potential sites being considered for the establishment of the Ukrainian Famine Memorial; summarizes the alternative site locations considered but eliminated by the Committee; describes the design objectives, constraints, and opportunities for developing the potential sites for the Memorial; and defines the No Action Alternative. The impacts of the proposed Memorial on the two alternative sites and surrounding areas will be assessed based on the potential physical development of the site, rather than a specific memorial design. The formal design process for the Memorial will be conducted subsequent to this environmental review process and will include reviews and approvals by the National Capital Planning Commission (NCPC), the Commission of Fine Arts (CFA), and other agencies as appropriate.

### 2.1 Consideration of Potential Sites

#### Site Selection Criteria

The Ukrainian authorities view a future Ukrainian Famine Memorial in Washington, DC not only as a token of recognition by the United States of those tragic events, but also as a reminder to a wider international community about the importance of the right to life, the freedom of speech, and political responsibility. Therefore, the Memorial should be sited in a public place exposed to the greatest extent possible to the eyes of both residents and visitors.

The National Committee conducted comprehensive comparisons of the location, physical characteristics, and surroundings of the potential sites for the Memorial based on a variety of criteria. The three most important factors considered include accessibility to the public/tourists; nexus of thematic relationships through relevance to the neighborhood; and landscape parameters and natural constraints.

#### Phase 1: Initial Sites Considered

The site selection process conducted by the Ukrainian Embassy in the United States and the National Committee began with an overview by the National Park Service (NPS) and a presentation of sites identified in the NCPC's *Memorials and Museums Master Plan*. These sites are located in Area II, outside of the Core, and are listed in the Plan as candidate sites for memorials.

The National Committee reviewed the 83 sites presented in the *Memorials and Museums Master Plan* that are located outside of the Reserve, and worked to narrow down the list of potential sites through the application of selected criteria including:

- I Sites should be easily accessible and highly visible to the public;
- II Sites should not be in a predominantly residential area due to the lack of connection between the subject matter and a neighborhood;
- III The size and location should be appropriate for the subject matter; and
- IV The site should not be located in proximity to an area predominantly used for entertainment purposes.

The elimination of sites for consideration through the application of the criteria is listed in Table 2-1.

**Table 2-1: Potential Memorial Sites Eliminated from Consideration during Phase 1**

| <b>Criteria</b>                                | <b>Sites Eliminated</b>   |
|--|---|
| I: Remote Locations                            | 4, 9, 14, 15, 16, 17, 20, 21, 22, 23, 28, 29, 30, 31, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 49, 50, 53, 54, 58, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 80, 81, 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 96, 99, 100 |
| II: Residential Areas                          | 8, 32, 33, 34, 35, 46   |
| III: Obscure, Small, or Poorly Accessible Site | 11, 27, 42, 43, 45, 47, 51, 52, 59, 60, 61, 62, 79, 97, 98  |
| IV: Proximity to Entertainment Area            | 7, 57   |

After applying the above criteria, two sites identified in the *Memorials and Museums Master Plan* remained as options. Site 26 is reserved as the future site of the American Veterans Disabled for Life Memorial; therefore, it was eliminated from consideration. The only remaining site, Site 44, was carried forward for further consideration in Phase 2 of the site selection process.

## Phase 2: Site Selection Coordinated with NPS

During the second stage in the site selection process, the Ukrainian Embassy and the National Committee worked in close cooperation with the NPS. A total of 24 potential sites were discussed and inspected by the Embassy, the Committee, and the NPS. These potential sites included nearly a dozen that were identified in the *Memorials and Museums Master Plan*, as well as ten additional Federal Reservations, and three additional sites favored by the National Committee.

- Site 32 - NE corner of Maryland and Constitution Avenue, NE
- Site 33 - NE corner of Maryland Avenue, NE
- Site 45 - Franklin Square, between I, K, 13<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> Streets, NW
- Site 26- Washington Avenue and Canal Street at 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, SW
- Site 34 - NE Corner of Pennsylvania and Independence Avenue, SE
- Site 46 - Rock Creek Park between M Street and Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
- Site 52- Northern end of Key Bridge at M Street, NW
- Site 57- Potomac River at the foot of Wisconsin Avenue, NE
- Site 60 - 25<sup>th</sup> Street on Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
- Site 61 - Washington Convention Center at Mount Vernon Square
- Site 62- Intersection of New York and New Jersey Avenues, NW
  
- US Reservation 072 - Massachusetts Avenue and 6<sup>th</sup> Street
- US Reservation 073 - Massachusetts Avenue at 6<sup>th</sup> Street, NW
- US Reservation Site 067 - NE corner of Massachusetts Avenue and M Street, at Thomas Circle
- US Reservation Site 074 - Massachusetts Avenue and 5<sup>th</sup> Street, NW
- US Reservation Site 078 - Intersection of North Capitol Street, Massachusetts Avenue, and F Street, NW
- US Reservation 172 - along New York Avenue and intersecting H and 13<sup>th</sup> Streets; in front of the “Lincoln” Presbyterian church
- US Reservation 195 - across from the Victims of Communism Memorial):
- US Reservation 328/329 - along Massachusetts Avenue, NW across from St. Sophia’s Greek Orthodox Church:
- Along Massachusetts Avenue, NW - across from British Embassy
- Shevchenko Monument - P and 22<sup>nd</sup> Streets, NW

As a result of this process, the list of potential sites was ultimately narrowed down to three sites found by the Committee:

1. US Reservation 30, at Pennsylvania Avenue between 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> Streets, NW identified as Site 44 in the *Memorials and Museums Master Plan*.
2. US Reservation 82, at the intersection of Massachusetts Avenue, 2<sup>nd</sup> and D Streets, NE
3. US Reservation 173, at the intersection of New York Avenue, 12<sup>th</sup> and I Streets, NW

The National Committee documented its findings in the *Site Selection Report*, dated October 2007. The 24 sites considered during this stage of the process are illustrated in Figure 2-1.

**Figure 2-1: Potential Memorial Sites Considered**



### Phase 3: Site Selection Guided by NCMAC

On October 23, 2007, the National Capital Memorials Advisory Commission (NCMAC) did not approve one of the three sites offered by the Committee. NCMAC instead suggested a site adjacent to the existing Shevchenko Memorial, and as an alternative, recommended a series of sites along Massachusetts Avenue.

The Committee rejected the notion of locating the Memorial adjacent to the existing Shevchenko Memorial. As a result, on February 26, 2008, the Committee presented three sites to the NCMAC:

- Walt Whitman Park Site at E Street NW – (Reservation # 715)
- New York Avenue Site at 12<sup>th</sup> Street NW – (Reservation # 173)
- Louisiana Avenue Site at 1<sup>st</sup> Street NW – (*Memorials and Museums Master Plan Site # 25*)

NCMC eliminated the Walt Whitman Site as too large, and again endorsed sites located along Massachusetts Avenue (near New Jersey Avenue). NCMC also suggested further study of the New York Avenue Site (Reservation #173) and the Louisiana Avenue Site (*Memorials and Museums Master Plan Site # 25*).

In response, the Committee prepared a detailed addendum to its previous site selection studies. The analysis included the consideration of contextual factors (surrounding uses, site orientation, distant views, and vehicular circulation) and physical condition factors (developable boundaries, existing vegetation, close-up views, and pedestrian circulation).

The Committee then presented four sites for consideration by NCMAC:

- New York Avenue at 12<sup>th</sup> Street NW (Reservation # 173)
- Louisiana Avenue at 1<sup>st</sup> Street NW (*Memorials and Museums Master Plan* Site # 25)
- Massachusetts Avenue at North Capitol Street NW (Reservation # 77A)
- New Jersey Avenue at 1<sup>st</sup> Street NW (Reservation # 196)

On July 9, 2008, NCMAC considered the four sites and recommended the New Jersey Avenue Site for the placement of a memorial to the Ukrainian Famine of 1932-1933. NCMAC also recommended the Massachusetts Avenue Site as an alternative location.

## 2.2 Selected Alternative Sites

Two alternative sites are being considered in this EA for the establishment of the Ukrainian Famine Memorial, referred to as the New Jersey Avenue Site and the Massachusetts Avenue Site.

### New Jersey Avenue Site

The New Jersey Avenue Site (US Reservation 196) is located within a 3,800 square-foot triangular parcel defined by its bordering roadways, 1<sup>st</sup> Street on its west side, F Street on its north side, and New Jersey Avenue, NW on its east side. The parcel is positioned directly in front of the National Association of Realtors building, known for its modern architecture and high rating for sustainability.

The New Jersey Avenue Site is located two blocks from Union Station and approximately four blocks from the US Capitol Building. The general area is characterized by office and government buildings. The site also borders the Georgetown University Law School campus. Several luxury hotels are located in the vicinity of the parcel.

### Massachusetts Avenue Site

The Massachusetts Avenue Site is located within a 3,100 square-foot triangular parcel defined by its bordering roadways, Massachusetts Avenue on its north side, North Capitol Street on its east side, and F Street on its south side. The site is located just one block from Union Station and in the vicinity of the US Capitol Building, which is approximately four blocks to the south.

The general area is characterized by office and government buildings and institutional and retail uses. The site is located within Downtown East and borders the NoMA redevelopment area.

## 2.3 Proposed Memorial

Although the proposed Memorial has not yet been designed, it is anticipated that the commemoration of this event will consist of a small-scale element such as a figurative sculpture. The open character of the site would be maintained and the Memorial would include typical memorial features such as an abstract or allegorical element in a landscaped setting.

## 2.4 No Action Alternative

Under the No Action Alternative, a site would not be selected for the establishment of the Ukrainian Famine Memorial at this time. The New Jersey Avenue and Massachusetts Avenue Sites would remain available for development until a subsequent development proposal could be approved and implemented.

Given that the authorizing legislation directs the National Committee to establish the Ukrainian Famine Memorial in the District of Columbia, under the No Action Alternative, the National Committee would need to continue to explore other potential sites for the Memorial.