

**2008 Fire Island Beach Nourishment Projects
Public Scoping Meeting
January 11, 2008 at Brookhaven Town Hall**

Oral comments following presentations:

Comment #:	Pertinent EA: (FI Communities, Suffolk County, Both EAs)	Comment
1	Both	What is the reason for the difference in schedules for EA development and review between the projects?
2	Both	There was a question asking for a confirmation that two EA's were being drafted and clarification about why there are two EA's.
3	Suffolk County	What is the reason for removing sand from a wide/stable part of the beach as this will increase the likelihood of wash-overs and breaches at this location? Why not obtain the sand from an offshore site?
4	FI Communities	What are the potential environmental effects on the biota and water quality within the borrow site? Is there potential for anoxic conditions (i.e. "a dead zone") to occur within the borrow site with adverse impacts on benthic organisms in the borrow site?
5	FI Communities	An attendee of the meeting requested a clarification of the financing of the project.
6	FI Communities	A question was asked about how the lifespan of a nourishment project was determined. It was noted that some reaches within previous nourishment projects seemed to have longer or shorter lifespans than others. Is it possible to provide areas with shorter anticipated lifespans with more sand?
7	FI Communities	An attendee requested that the EA address the existing hard structures within the communities (such as jetties and geo-tubes). Will these structures be buried?
8	Both	The projects propose a commencement date of September 15. How will impacts to recreational uses of the beaches be minimized?
9	FI Communities	An attendee requested a clarification of the role of Land Use Ecological Services (the FI Communities' consultants) in the process.
10	FI Communities	An attendee expressed concern that the project posed an undue financial burden to FI homeowners and the Federal and State governments have a responsibility to provide funding for the project.
11	FI Communities	An attendee asked for an explanation of FINS's policies and opinions on breaches in the Wilderness Area and the communities. M. Bilecki stated the FINS has a Breach Management Plan.
12	Suffolk County	Mark Carrara of the NYSDEC requested that Suffolk County needs to address alternative sand sources in the EA.
13	FI Communities	An attendee asked about the beach elevation criteria for beach scraping including how is elevation 7' determined prior to scraping and why is elevation 7' used as a benchmark.
14	FI Communities	An attendee asked for an explanation of FINS's current opinion on tapering of nourishment areas and the potential for placement of sand on FINS property.
15	Both	An attendee requested that the EA provide an examination/discussion of the projects in the context of the FINS authorization legislation.
16	Both	An attendee requested that the EA provide a discussion of hard shoreline structures as alternatives to the proposed projects.

Comment #:	Pertinent EA: (FI Communities, Suffolk County, Both EAs)	Comment
17	FI Communities	An attendee noted that there is great variability in the shape of the dunes and beaches within the proposed nourishment area. The attendee requested that the potential for placing more sand in areas with narrow beaches and/or low dunes (i.e. erosion hot-spots) be considered.
18	FI Communities	An attendee asked if the size of the proposed project will be influenced by the FI-MP Reformulation Study.
19	Suffolk County	An attendee asked that it be noted that any sediments dredged for navigation purposed be salvaged and utilized for erosion protection on beaches.
20	FI Communities	It was suggested that the discussion of “soft” erosion control solutions be expanded to include methods of sub-tidal sand-trapping (i.e. “sea-scaping”).
21	Both	An attendee noted that is was important for the EA to represent a “paradigm shift” or “shift in culture” regarding beach management to include effects of proposed projects on all the benefits provided by FINS.

Written comments left in comment box:

Comment #:	Pertinent EA: (FI Communities, Suffolk County, Both EAs)	Comment
1	FI Communities	“Concern about sink holes and dead zones from borrow area”