

Comment ID #		Comment (Direct quotations from comment submissions)
8	C	2) Alcatraz is part of the Bay Trail to connect more people.
8	C	1) Alcatraz: Historic westside prisoners' gardens s/b designated "Evolved Cultural landscape" in all alternatives (See Carole Ashford).
19	E	<p>Put a statue of a Native American woman (Ohlone?) on the island, the same size as the Statue of Liberty, it would be fitting, considering the history of Alcatraz. Maybe have a design contest...</p> <p>There is an artists welding center in Oakland called "The Crucible" , I'm sure they could build a statue.</p> <p>If not them ,then some other American artist could do it.</p> <p>It would be a wonderful balance for the country, and it would be a beautiful symbol of recognition of the Native Americans. Plus, it would be a HUGE moneymaker!</p>
22	E	<p>I just read an article requesting input on the establishment of a hotel on the island. I would like to make a suggestion that could possibly be less costly, and possibly attract many more for a stay. Revamp 20 or 25 of the cells, and offer a package weekend stay for tourists, say \$200.00 for the package, which would include the stay in an assigned cell, and meals, with the tour of the island. I believe that this would give the tourist the ultimate experience, and allow them to experience something which can't be done elsewhere. I know that I would take advantage of it, particularly if it is the former cell of a notorious criminal. I also believe that there would be such a demand, in the future you would have to expand the number of cells available.</p>
23	E	<p>NO NO NO!!! to Alcatraz development!!! Are you crazy? Leave The Rock alone, don't destroy it's character, and say NO to a hotel or any other development. This is about respect, history, cultural sensitivity, and just plain sense! I am appalled at the irresponsible behavior of this, the agency entrusted with the preservation of our most sacred areas. The NPS mission is about preservation first, and how could enjoyment be really enhanced by a hotel on a prison island?</p>
26	I	<p>Alcatraz - sell the trash as treasure in the bookstore!; I believe this resource needs to be maintained as a destination and all facilities need to remain accessible to the public; From my experience the public enjoys this island for it's built environment and it's historic human presence; develop green energy sources for the island; I like Power Plant Alt. # 1</p>
32	P	<p>Think big! Put a statue of Justice on the rock that would be similar to and be a sister to the Statue of Liberty on our country's opposite coast. California has long been a leader in fighting for Justice. Many movements have thrived here, from farm workers to Native Americans to gay couples. Immigrants have sought freedom and justice here in California. What could be more uplifting than a giant statue of justice arising out of a decrepit old prison. Like SF rebuilding after the Earthquake of 1906, like our recovery after flood and fire, like immigrants beginning a new life... California is about new beginnings and equal chances. A beautiful statue of Justice would symbolize that and provide inspiration for all.</p>

32	P	<p>PS It would help attract international attention and tourist \$\$\$.</p> <p>PSS Keep the some of the prison and grounds for tours similar to current use. Preserve the native wildlife on and around the island. Don't invest heavily in preserving an old prison; invest in the future not the past. No hotels, meeting rooms, retreat centers.... etc.</p> <p>Send me a proper email address instead of this form and I can send you some pictures of Justice, hopefully photo-shopped onto Alcatraz. This form would not allow me to add them.</p>
35	C	<p>Alcatraz must provide ample/maximum habitat for nesting birds. This is compatible with human use of the island.</p>
43	P	<p>I urge the Parks Service to keep Alcatraz as a historical site, bringing the history of that prison, its inmates, episodes in that history to the public.</p> <p>The prison is a unique chance for average citizens to get an idea of what prison is like. Citizens urge being "tough on crime" with no idea what is happening to the over 2 million people in the US under lock and key.</p>
43	P	<p>We are the number one world leaders in locking up our citizens. We need to understand more what this actually means and Alcatraz is a wonderful opportunity to teach that lesson.</p> <p>I urge you to bring out the sense of what prison is even more than you do (very well) now.</p>

80	P	<p>Looking more specifically into the Alcatraz alternatives I have some major concerns. For the Island perimeter area alternatives 1 and 3 worry me. Alternatives 1 and 3 say that they allow for trails around the perimeter to be open all times of the year for visitors, but at the same time managed to protect natural habitat values. If the visitors are allowed in any of the current closed areas during the breeding season (Feb 1 - Sept 15), the birds will choose not to breed there and there will no longer be nesting birds to be observed while they are on this trail. Overall I believe more natural resource protection, interpretation, and outreach are needed on the Island. This is an important part of Alcatraz's natural history and what Alcatraz used to be like before anything was built on the Island. It is a great opportunity for people to connect with nature up close, which doesn't happen very often these days and should be thought of as just as important as the prison and military years. Keeping the historic gardens land space to what they have now is important, the more space they are given the more habitat is taken away from the seabirds on the Island. These gardens are beautiful and the visitors enjoy them, but they can not overtake the Island because this is habitat loss for the seabirds. Also if food service is brought to the Island this will increase the amount of trash and food scraps on the Island which will foster rats and other predators which will negatively affect the seabirds. There are two things which I agree with about the other alternatives on Alcatraz. I believe the laundry building should be able to be used for events outside of the breeding season. Also I think the historic buoys in alternative three should be set out not only for historic reasons, but for resource protection and keeping boats away from the birds on the Island. I also think taking small boats from Fort Mason as getting part of the historic feel of the ferry ride as well is a great idea. Overall I believe alternative number 2 is the most important, although I realize people have differing opinions and some concepts from all alternatives will probably be implemented. I agree with some of the different ideas of alternatives 1 and 3, but I hope the committee always keeps in mind the wildlife and native habitats that our parks have and need to protect for future generations. Thank you!</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island- Alternative 2 Overview: Offering visitors more opportunities for learning about the island's natural as well as cultural history and current resources to provide a better balance between the two management mandates. Main Prison Building and adjacent areas: Maintaining natural areas and seasonal closures around the Laundry Building, Model Industries Building, Parade Ground and western side of the island, while still providing limited visitor access for wildlife viewing, research and education. Maintaining the rubble piles as important bird breeding habitat. Power Plant and Quartermaster Warehouse: We commend attempts to protect sensitive seabird areas around the Laundry Building and Model Industries building during breeding season (February - September) by excluding maintenance activities and visitor access near these structures during February- September. Island Perimeter: Positive natural resource protections proposed in Alternative 2 include the preservation and protection of natural habitat values with visitor use and access highly managed around the island perimeter (i.e., seasonal closures near seabird breeding colonies along the northeastern, south and west perimeters).</p>

81	P	Offshore Marine Environment: Positive natural resource protections proposed in Alternative 2 include a sensitive resource zone out to 300' off the island's western shore that would exclude boat traffic, while still allowing some boat traffic along the eastern side of the island.
81	P	<p>Visitor Areas: We agree with the seasonal closure of the Agave Trail and Parade Ground, as presently maintained, which is an important management tactic to protect sensitive breeding bird resources, including Western and California Gulls, Brandt's Cormorants breeding on the cliffs directly below the Parade Ground, and Pigeon Guillemots nesting in crevices all along the cliffs and below the Agave Trail.</p> <p>It is not clear from the map presented in conjunction with Alternative 2 if the West Road would remain open to visitors. Increased interpretive signs and placards warning of restricted areas due to seabird breeding are needed in this area, but the West Road offers the only cormorant colony viewing available to visitors. From this standpoint, the West Road access is extremely valuable for education and outreach associated with the theme of preserving and enjoying coastal ecosystems.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island- Alternative 3</p> <p>Offshore Marine Environment: Reinstalling a line of historic buoys circling the island to prohibit boat traffic near the island (particularly the western shore to reduce disturbance to seabird colonies).</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 1</p> <p>Food Service: The introduction of food service on the island would create a much greater potential for " injury to wildlife (gulls eating and getting tangled in food trash), " negative interactions between wildlife and humans (gulls becoming aggressive while attempting to get food from visitors), " increased trash, and introduction of pests and predators such as rats (which can decimate seabird colonies by eating eggs and small chicks).</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 1</p> <p>Overnight Accommodations: Providing overnight accommodations (hotel, hostel, camping) would " introduce additional disruption of seabird nesting and roosting areas through human activity, night-lighting, noise, " increased potential for visitors accessing unauthorized areas.</p>

81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 1</p> <p>Visitor Areas: Alternative 1 suggests that gulls should be managed in 'core visitor areas' including the Parade Ground and Laundry Building which would be 'high-use' visitor areas. " The Parade Ground currently provides the largest non-disturbed area of Western Gull and Black-crowned Night-heron breeding habitat, as well as the only breeding habitat for California Gulls. " Increased human use of the Laundry Building area would be disruptive to Western Gulls as well as Brandt's Cormorants nesting adjacent to the building. " The potential to disrupt breeding Black Oystercatchers, Pelagic Cormorants and Pigeon Guillemots along the cliffs and seawall under the Laundry Building would also be quite high (this is the only location on the island at which Pelagic Cormorants and Black Oystercatchers nest).</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 1</p> <p>Model Industries Building: Alternative 1 also suggests using the Model Industries Building for Park Operations with high staff use. " This would greatly increase disturbance to Brandt's and Pelagic Cormorants, Western Gulls, Pigeon Guillemots, Black Oystercatchers, and Black-crowned Night-herons nesting nearby.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 1</p> <p>Trails: Opening trails such as the Agave Trail and Lower Walkways would " remove much additional gull and night heron breeding habitat " potentially disturb breeding guillemots and cormorants (those which have been using the area north of the Powerhouse and south of the Dock). " Alternative 1 designates a 'sensitive' area along the western cliffs, but from the map it doesn't appear as if this includes the walkway below Barker Beach and the Greenhouse Gardens. If not, this would greatly increase the potential for disturbance to the largest concentration of breeding Brandt's Cormorants, night herons and Snowy Egrets. " A scenic corridor around the perimeter of Alcatraz would be established by Alternative 1, anticipated as a moderate to high use area. If allowed between February September when birds are nesting, this would not provide sufficient wildlife protection.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Food Service: Introduction of food service at Building 64 would: " pose a greater potential for injury to wildlife (gulls eating and getting tangled in food trash), " increase negative interactions between wildlife and humans (gulls begging/stealing food), " increase trash on the island, " and could contribute to the introduction of predators to the island such as rats.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Overnight Accommodations: Providing overnight accommodations (hotel, hostel, camping) would " introduce additional disruption of seabird nesting and roosting areas through human activity, night-lighting, noise, " increased potential for visitors accessing unauthorized areas.</p>

81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Building and Landscape Maintenance: Proposed increased maintenance of landscapes between the Dock and the Cellhouse would: " reduce available Western Gull and Black-crowned Night-heron habitat, Since this is the most highly-trafficked visitor pathway and the bird habitat in this area has largely already been lost, this could be viewed as a mitigation for other areas now being used or proposed to be opened (such as near the Model Industries or Laundry Buildings, etc.). These other areas could remain closed and highlighted through outreach efforts as a valuable natural resource and the wild side of Alcatraz which is also an important part of the island's history.</p> <p>Although we commend attempts to protect sensitive seabird areas around the Laundry Building and Model Industries building during breeding season (February September), we are not sure it is realistic for the park to forego all maintenance on these structures, given its mandate to protect both natural and cultural resources. It should be feasible for maintenance to be done on these buildings and surrounding structures during the non-seabird breeding season (fall winter).</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Visitor Areas: It is not clear from the map presented in conjunction with Alternative 2 if the West Road would remain open to visitors. Increased interpretive signs and placards warning of restricted areas due to seabird breeding are needed in this area, but the West Road offers the only cormorant colony viewing available to visitors. From this standpoint, the West Road access is extremely valuable for education and outreach associated with the theme of preserving and enjoying coastal ecosystems.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Marine Zone: Expanding the definition of "sensitive area" in the 300 foot closure could be improved by designating the area as a no-use zone during seabird breeding season (February September). Even one unintentional human intrusion into this area, if ill-timed and too close, could cause seabird colony abandonment. A scenic corridor of moderate to high use allowed past 300' away from the island would probably be fine with regards to the bird resources on the island, as long as loud noises (such as gunshots and cannon fire) were not allowed.</p>
81	P	<p>Alcatraz Island: Alternative 3</p> <p>Building and Landscape Maintenance: This alternative proposes the major renovation of many island structures. Construction projects should be limited to outside the bird breeding season from February - September.</p>

81	P	<p>Visitor Areas: Alternative 3 also proposed a high-use area in and around the Model Industries Building. This proposal for moderate and high use in the listed areas would:</p> <p>" effectively remove most of the bird breeding habitat on Alcatraz, as the birds rely on undisturbed habitat to successfully raise young, " increase disturbance to all species of breeding waterbirds in any remaining habitat, " and, the Model Industries and Laundry Building areas in particular are very high density bird areas and the only location of some breeding species (e.g., Pelagic Cormorants, Black Oystercatchers).</p>
81	P	<p>Marine Zone: Alternative 3 does propose a Historic Immersion Zone with no access within 1000' of the island, delineated by buoys which would potentially protect seabird colonies from marine-based disturbance (boats, kayaks, jet skis, etc). However, if on-island uses are allowed as proposed in earlier sections of Alternative 3, this would preclude the formation of any seabird colonies during the breeding season and thus marine-based protection would be pointless from a natural resources standpoint.</p>
81	P	<p>" We find that none of the alternatives as presently described will meet the Park Service mandate to adequately protect both cultural and natural resources on the island.</p>
81	P	<p>" The introduction of food service and overnight accommodations to the island would likely have significant negative affects on bird nesting, roosting, foraging behavior, survival.</p>
81	P	<p>" Opening the Parade Ground, Laundry Building, Model Industries Building, Agave Trail, Lower Walkways, the walkway below Barker Beach, and the Greenhouse Gardens to increased visitor use will have significant impacts on bird populations, including the exclusion of important breeding colonies from Alcatraz Island.</p>
81	P	<p>" Seasonal closures such as those already in place are an important tool for managing mixed use areas and should be considered for all revised access and maintenance activities.</p>
81	P	<p>" Human access by tourists and maintenance to sensitive natural resource areas (seabird breeding colonies) should be prevented during the months of February September.</p>
81	P	<p>" Conservation of seabirds in the marine zone could be improved if the 300 foot sensitive area was defined as a no-use zone during the months of February September.</p>
81	P	<p>" Reinstalling a line of historic buoys circling the island to prohibit boat traffic near the island (particularly the western shore), would reduce disturbance to seabird colonies.</p>
81	C	<p>Alcatraz: providing overnight stay is a bad idea and too costly for what is achieved. Bad use of funding.</p>
83	E	<p>I heard on the news that you might be opening tourist attractions on Alcatraz. I would like to suggest Alcatraz be converted to an island like the Mackinac Island in Michigan with no automobiles. Transportation by horses, carriages or bicycles/tricycles. If visitors prefer, hiking.</p>

85	C	Many of the ideas contained within the Alcatraz alternatives 1 & 3 are very good. The focus of the island should be on the cultural human experience. The idea about a hotel overnight accommodation is a mistake. The city of SF has enough rooms already - and those rooms have power and sewage systems in place - not so for Alcatraz. Yes, the Alcatraz plan should include a general clean up of the islands rubble piles. Why does this National Park feature enormous piles of trash? Trash and the smell of thousands of bird waste have no place in one of Americas treasures. The plan for converting Alcatraz building b4 into a hotel is shortsighted. The building rests atop a pre-civil war fortification that is not earthquake safe. The problems with water , power and sewage will bankrupt the park hotel operator.
89	P	ALCATRAZ- I oppose expansion of buildings on Alcatraz. I support the use of existing buildings for such uses as overnight use. The proposed Alcatraz Island over night facilities and food service should be designed and built in an environmentally friendly and sustainable manner and which restricts wildlife from accessing human food or trash.
93	L	We strongly support removing the rubble from the parade ground and opening this area to more foot traffic.
93	L	We strongly support concentrating the bird nesting on the western side of the Island.
93	L	We strongly support rebuilding the Social Hall for use as the Alcatraz Alumni Museum, and include the two lane bowling alley and snack bar on the lower floor with full auditorium and commercial kitchen on the main floor to provide services to the public.
93	L	We support refurbishing Industries buildings for gatherings, meetings, class rooms, museum and displays, including an operating kitchen.
93	L	We support refurbishing apartments in 64 building, for use as a centerpiece, multipurpose facility to include overnight Hostel lodging, Post Office, canteen, class rooms, administrative offices.
93	L	We support using the kitchen of the Cell House for use of overnight lodging.
93	L	If there is to be a hotel on Alcatraz, we would support the rebuilding of A, B, & C buildings for use as a hotel. The outer façade and interior common areas should be to historic dimensions and finishes.
93	L	We support green technology for sewer, heat, water, power, etc. with necessary equipment housed in existing shop buildings or concealed from the public view and access.
93	L	We support rebuilding the two apartments of the Light House; the Wardens house; four Lieutenants cottages; rebuilding the Medical Technicians house, behind the Wardens House; rebuilding the No. 2 Road Tower. (We were able to salvage the spot light); purchase and restoration of the Warden Johnston to be maintained at its historic pier. Any of these structures could be used by GGNRA staff, and for overnight lodging, classrooms, artifact sales, museums, and food service.
125	P	The proposed Alcatraz Island overnight facilities and food service should be designed and built in an environmentally friendly and sustainable manner and which restricts wildlife from accessing human food or trash.

177	P	Preliminary Alternatives for Alcatraz Island. I support Alternatives 2 and 3 for all of Alcatraz. I believe the wildlife and cultural history of the island should be protected. I do not believe a hotel should be built on the island. In my opinion that would ruin the cultural history of this site. people come to this island to learn about the prison, not to stay in a hotel. Building minor overnight accommodations within the existing structures would be preferable, but I believe that already exists with the educational overnight stays in the cells.
202	L	Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the GGNRA plans. I'd like to suggest that on Alcatraz Island, ample space should be dedicated for birds and other wildlife that need an undisturbed place to rest and nest in the bay. I believe this is listed as Alternative 2.
212	L	ALCATRAZ ISLAND There are many problems with Alternative 1 that make it inappropriate for this or any other unit of the National Park System. The categorical denial of the natural values of the island is unacceptable. Of particular concern is that the section "Arrival Area including the entry pier and Building 64" needs a natural history element. We oppose opening closed areas to the public. This would cause irreparable environmental damage to seabirds. Building more amenities such as a hotel is completely inappropriate for Alcatraz. It is actually a contrast to the actual history of the island in which prisoners were kept in strict confinement. The idea that sensitive wildlife areas need preservation is incomplete. Cliffs are the most significant element of habitat that needs preservation and they aren't even mentioned. Management of gulls to reduce conflicts in core visitor use areas could well mean shooting or poisoning gulls. This is a terrible idea for an agency that is supposed to preserve the natural elements of our parks. Human impacts need to be controlled. We oppose the Diverse Opportunities Zone in favor of maintaining the status quo. We oppose removal of rubble from the Parade Ground and any efforts to manage bird populations to accommodate enhanced visitor access. Should the "Natural Zone" proposed in Alternative 1 be adopted it would require the destruction of significant bird habitat. Closing seabird colonies, particularly cliffs, during the nesting season only would compromise their value as roosting sites. All access points above cliff dwelling birds should be permanently closed.
212	L	Should alternative 1 be adopted there are significant problems associated with it that must be considered. First is the matter of fresh water. It would seem the only way to provide an ample supply of fresh water for the proposed amenities would be to install a pipeline to San Francisco. That must be made part of this proposal if it goes further. Second is the matter of supplying food, laundry services, trash removal and all the other things that are part of a major resort. Maintaining a residential visitor complex will require a considerably greater activity on the island and that must be addressed as well. For those reasons, as well as the impact on wildlife, we oppose Alternative 1.
212	L	We oppose Alternative 3 because it too would reduce bird habitat and underemphasize the natural values of the island.

212	L	We support Alternative 2 for Alcatraz. Specifically, we support improvements to the arrival/departure area and Building 64 that include wildlife and environmentally friendly design. Access to wildlife that would be disruptive to their nesting or their roosting should be limited to researchers and park staff and volunteers. Food services should be limited and no human food should be permitted on the island's trails or outdoor areas. Beside interpreting the island's history, it is critical that the National Park Service improve the interpretation of the island's natural history. As one of the west coast's most easily accessible, and most significant, seabird colonies, the natural history interpretation of Alcatraz should equal that of its historic interpretation.
212	L	For the most part, Golden Gate Audubon supports Alternative 2 for the San Francisco coastline. We don't agree with any alternative for Land's End and we have significant questions about alternatives for Ocean Beach and Fort Funston.
218	L	<p>Alcatraz Island</p> <p>Marin Audubon supports Alternative 2 as the alternative that is the most protective of Alcatraz's incredibly rich and diverse avian resources, however, for the reasons listed below, this alternative has some aspects that would be detrimental. In particular establishing food service opening the Parade Ground.</p> <p>With the removal of the prison and intensive human uses, wildlife have recolonized Alcatraz and it has become the most diverse and intensely used island for breeding and roosting seabirds in the Bay and probably along the Coast as well.. Certainly the use of Alcatraz by wildlife goes back many centuries, but this historic use has not been documented and recognized. While the human historical uses are emphasized these days, in our view Alcatraz's bird life ranks up with the Galapagos and as a single island probably has more diversity and populations than most of the Galapagos. Protection of its current and historic natural resources should be emphasized in all planning. Unfortunately, none of the alternatives currently described would provide adequate protection for natural resources.</p>
218	L	For all alternatives, we strongly oppose introduction of food service because of potential adverse impacts. Food service will create conditions that will incite the gulls to become more aggressive increased trash, negative interactions between people and birds, and increased predators (rats) which can significantly impact nesting colonies by eating eggs.
218	L	Overnight Accommodations (camping, hotel) should not be introduced because the increased human activity, lighting, food use and noise, all of which would adversely impact the nesting colonies and roosting birds. It would increase the risk of extensive disturbance because, unless guards were present at the nesting areas all night, it would provide opportunities for people to go into closed nesting areas and cause significant disturbance. This could lead to abandonment of colonies.

<p>218</p>	<p>L</p>	<p>We have the following specific recommendations about Alternative 2 to best ensure it does not create conditions that will degrade natural resources:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Close all maintenance and access areas during nesting season (February to September) Seasonal To reduce disturbance potential to nesting birds. 2. In the Marine Zone, designate a 300-foot closure along the northeastern, south and west perimeter areas as no-use zones during seabird breeding season from February to September. The buoys that once circled the island should be replaced to noticing boaters that boats are prohibited. Also, access to these colonies from above on the island must be restricted during breeding season. 3. Maintain natural areas around the Laundry building, Model Industries building, the Parade Grounds, the western side of the island and the rubble piles which are important breeding habitat. Particularly during breeding season, visitors and maintenance activity should he prohibited. Maintenance on the landscape between the dock and cellhouse should be conducted during the Fall and Winter months only, when the seabirds are not nesting. 4. Establish seasonal closures of Agave Trail and the Parade Ground to protect sensitive breeding birds (Western and California Gulls, Brandt’s Cormorants, breeding on the cliffs below the Parade Ground, Pigeon Guillemots nesting on the cliffs below Agave
<p>218</p>	<p>L</p>	<p>Regarding other Alternatives. Alternative 1 (See discussion above about food service and overnight use) We strongly oppose opening the Parade Ground and Laundry buildings to visitor use at all, much less for high use access. Furthermore the concept of “managing” the gulls in the ‘core visitor” areas Parade Ground is unrealistic and impossible. The Parade Ground is the largest non- disturbed area of Western Gull and Black-crowned Night Heron breeding habitat and the only breeding for California Gulls. The Laundry building is a breeding site for Western Gulls and Brandt’s Cormorants nest adjacent to the building. Allowing these to be high use areas would have widespread and significant impact to these species. Further, there is potential for significant destruction of breeding Black Oystercatchers, Pelagic Cormorant and Pigeon Guillemot along the seawall under the laundry buildings. Using the Model Industries Building for Park operations would also adversely impact Pigeon Guillemots, Black Oystercatchers and Black-crowned Nigh Herons Opening the Agave Trail, lower walkways, walkway between Barker Beach and Greenhouse Gardens corridor around perimeter of the island all would have significant adverse impact to nesting birds in the vicinity. We urge that these trail not be opened.</p>

218	L	<p>Alternative 3 -</p> <p>This alternative could have significant adverse impacts from major renovation of many island structures with no recognition that nesting season February to September should be avoided. Moderate to high use areas are proposed in and around Model Industry's building should be dropped. Because this area is used by many of the birds to raise young, this use would eliminate most of the breeding habitat, would cause the birds to concentrate in other areas thereby increasing predation and disturbance in all other areas. Of particular concern is that only places Black Oystercatchers and Pelagic Cormorants nest is the Model Industries and Laundry Building areas.</p> <p>The proposal for a 1,000 foot Historic Immersion Zone around the island could be beneficial to the birds, but only if on the on-island activities were restricted. Otherwise there would be disturbance from above which would significantly reduce or destroy the nesting seabird colony.</p>
222	L	<p>Alcatraz Island:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Hotel or overnight accommodations on the island, think about the costs of supplying fresh water and waste removal. • Food services, yes <p>I take offense with your statement."The rubble on the Parade Ground would be removed and bird populations would be managed to accommodate enhanced visitor access. "It should be the other way around.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Don't commercialize Alcatraz, we do not need a Disneyland
228	L	<p>I have a suggestion regarding Alcatraz Island. It is the perfect place to have a Museum of Torture. I have visited the Museum of Torture in Paris, France, and it is quite a draw. There are guillotines surrounded by huge pictures of lopped off heads, garrotes used in Spain to separate neck vertebrae (very painful before you die), nipple pinchers (pliers), things to pull out finger nails or jam metal wedges underneath, sharp pegs to sit on, etc. There are some nifty devices out there! Most of the devices are accompanied by huge pictures of similar devices in use.</p> <p>People line up by the thousands to get into this place. Go and visit it. They have about 300 torture devices. I guess you could add water boarding to the list.</p> <p>Anyway, people do relish this sort of thing and they will pay an entrance price.</p> <p>My vote for an income-earner at Alcatraz is to open a Torture Museum.</p>

240	L	<p>The Alcatraz Island Intertribal Living Museum (AIILM). Two of the most significant legacies of the Indian Occupation of Alcatraz Island are: the acknowledgement that Native Cultures are still alive, and a sense of Hemispherical Intertribal Unity.</p> <p>Civic Engagement for the AIILM would be on a national and interactional level, working with Tribal Museums through out the United States, Canada and Latin America. Due to the broad geographic area the AIILM will be dealing with, operational control must remain with the Alcatraz Island curatorial staff.</p> <p>Through Civic Engagement an appropriate museum location site can be determined in cooperation. The selection committee would determined if an existing building should be renovated, or start a new facility from scratch.</p> <p>One recommendation is to place for the AIILM on the ground level of the New Industries building that faces the Golden Gate. There are two large rooms in the New Industries building that could accommodate the AIILM. The first room should be a transition room and the second room the actual gallery area. The gallery area (interior of second room) needs to be encapsulated to provide a museum quality environment to control light, temperature and humidity. The impressive view of the Golden Gate needs to be maintained for dramatic effect, with sealed UV filtered glass and if need be inner partitions. The first room could have interpretive panels explaining the Living Indian Museum concept and program. Most importantly, the first room would be an environmental transition space. If the first room is not enough of an environmental buffer to maintain the environmental controls in the gallery room, then it is recommended that a rotating glass door be used to maintain the environmental seal in the gallery room.</p> <p>Another recommendation would be to refurbish what is now called the "Chapel" next to the Electric Shop. The main consideration for this building is to create a handicap access. If it is determined that a new facility is needed, a recommended site would be at the edge of the Parade Grounds facing San Francisco. Site location, size and other details would be negotiated through Civic Engagement.</p>
-----	---	--

241	L	<p>Alcatraz Island - Alternative 2</p> <p>Overview: Offering visitors more opportunities for learning about the island's natural as well as cultural history and current resources to provide a better balance between the two management mandates.</p> <p>Main Prison Building and adjacent areas: Maintaining natural areas and seasonal closures around the Laundry Building, Model Industries Building, Parade Ground and western side of the island, while still providing limited visitor access for wildlife viewing, research and education. Maintaining the rubble piles as important bird breeding habitat.</p> <p>Power Plant and Quartermaster Warehouse: We commend attempts to protect sensitive seabird areas around the Laundry Building and Model Industries building during breeding season (February - September) by excluding maintenance activities and visitor access near these structures during February - September.</p> <p>Island Perimeter: Positive natural resource protections proposed in Alternative 2 include the preservation and protection of natural habitat values with visitor use and access highly managed around the island perimeter (Le.. seasonal closures near seabird breeding colonies along the northeastern, south and west perimeters).</p>
241	L	<p>Visitor Areas: We agree with the seasonal closure of the Agave Trail and Parade Ground, as presently maintained, which is an important management tactic to protect sensitive breeding bird resources, including Western and California Gulls, Brandt's Cormorants breeding on the cliffs directly below the Parade Ground, and Pigeon Guillemots nesting in crevices all along the cliffs and below the Agave Trail.</p> <p>It is not clear from the map presented in conjunction with Alternative 2 if the West Road would remain open to visitors. Increased interpretive signs and placards warning of restricted areas due to seabird breeding are needed in this area, but the West Road offers the only cormorant colony viewing available to visitors. From this standpoint, the West Road access is extremely valuable for education and outreach associated with the theme of preserving and enjoying coastal ecosystems.</p>
241	L	<p>Offshore Marine Environment: Positive natural resource protections proposed in Alternative 2 include a sensitive resource zone out to 300' off the island's western shore that would exclude boat traffic, while still allowing some boat traffic along the eastern side of the island. Reinstalling a line of historic buoys circling the island to prohibit boat traffic near the island (particularly the western shore to reduce disturbance to seabird colonies).</p>

241	L	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative I</p> <p>Food Service: The introduction of food service on the island would create a much greater potential for</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • injury to wildlife (gulls eating and getting tangled in food trash), • negative interactions between wildlife and humans (gulls becoming aggressive while attempting to get food from visitors). • increased trash. and introduction of pests and predators such as rats (which can decimate seabird colonies by eating eggs and small chicks). <p>Overnight Accommodations: Providing overnight accommodations (hotel. hostel. camping) would</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • introduce additional disruption of seabird nesting and roosting areas through human activity, night-lighting, noise. • increased potential for visitors accessing unauthorized areas.
241	L	<p>Visitor Areas: Alternative I suggests that gulls should be managed in 'core visitor areas' including the Parade Ground and Laundry Building which would be 'high-use' visitor areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Parade Ground currently provides the largest non-disturbed area of Western Gull and Black-crowned Night-heron breeding habitat, as well as the only breeding habitat for California Gulls. • Increased human use of the Laundry Building area would be disruptive to Western Gulls as well as Brandt's Cormorants nesting adjacent to the building. • The potential to disrupt breeding Black Oystercatchers. Pelagic Cormorants and Pigeon Guillemots along the cliffs and seawall under the Laundry Building would also be quite high (this is the only location on the island at which Pelagic Cormorants and Black Oystercatchers nest). <p>Model Industries Building: Alternative I also suggests using the Model Industries Building for Park Operations with high staff use.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This would greatly increase disturbance to Brandt's and Pelagic Cormorants. <p>Western Gulls, Pigeon Guillemots, Black Oystercatchers. and Black-crowned Night herons nesting nearby.</p>

241	L	<p>Trails: Opening trails such as the Agave Trail and Lower Walkways would</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • remove much additional gull and night heron breeding habitat • potentially disturb breeding guillemots and cormorants (those which have been using the area north of the Powerhouse and south of the Dock). • Alternative I designates a 'sensitive' area along the western cliffs. but from the map it doesn't appear as if this includes the walkway below Barker Beach and the Greenhouse Gardens. If not, this would greatly increase the potential for disturbance to the largest concentration of breeding Brandt's Cormorants, night herons and Snowy Egrets. • A scenic corridor around the perimeter of Alcatraz would be established by Alternative I, anticipated as a moderate to high use area. If allowed between February - September when birds are nesting. this would not provide sufficient wildlife protection.
241	L	<p>Alcatraz Island Alternative 2</p> <p>Food Service: Introduction of food service at Building 64 would:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pose a greater potential for injury to wildlife (gulls eating and getting tangled in food trash), • increase negative interactions between wildlife and humans (gulls begging/stealing food). • increase trash on the island. • and could contribute to the introduction of predators to the island such as rats. <p>Overnight Accommodations: Providing overnight accommodations (hotel. hostel, camping) would</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • introduce additional disruption of seabird nesting and roosting areas through human activity, night-lighting. noise. • increased potential for visitors accessing unauthorized areas.

241	L	<p>Building and Landscape Maintenance: Proposed increased maintenance of landscapes between the Dock and the Cell house would:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • reduce available Western Gull and Black-crowned Night-heron habitat, <p>Since this is the most highly-trafficked visitor pathway and the bird habitat in this area has largely already been lost, this could be viewed as a mitigation for other areas now being used or proposed to be opened (such as near the Model Industries or Laundry Buildings. etc.). These other areas could remain closed and highlighted through outreach efforts as a valuable natural resource and the wild side of Alcatraz which is also an important part of the island's history.</p> <p>Although we commend attempts to protect sensitive seabird areas around the Laundry Building and Model Industries building during breeding season (February - September). we are not sure it is realistic for the park to forego all maintenance on these structures. given its mandate to protect both natural and cultural resources. It should be feasible for maintenance to be done on these buildings and surrounding structures during the no seabird breeding season (fall - winter).</p>
241	L	<p>Visitor Areas: It is not clear from the map presented in conjunction with Alternative 2 if the West Road would remain open to visitors. Increased interpretive signs and placards warning of restricted areas due to seabird breeding are needed in this area, but the West Road offers the only cormorant colony viewing available to visitors. From this standpoint. the West Road access is extremely valuable for education and outreach associated with the theme of preserving and enjoying coastal ecosystems.</p> <p>Marine Zone: Expanding the definition of "sensitive area" in the 300 foot closure could be improved by designating the area as a no-use zone during seabird breeding season (February - September). Even one unintentional human intrusion into this area, if ill-timed and too close, could cause seabird colony abandonment. A scenic corridor of moderate to high use allowed past 300' away from the island would probably be fine with regards to the bird resources on the island, as long as loud noises (such as gunshots and cannon fire) were not allowed.</p>
241	L	<p>Alcatraz Island: Alternative 3</p> <p>Building and Landscape Maintenance: This alternative proposes the major renovation of many island structures. Construction projects should be limited to outside the bird breeding season from February - September.</p>

241	L	<p>Visitor Areas: Alternative 3 also proposed a high-use area in and around the Model Industries Building. This proposal for moderate and high use in the listed areas would:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • effectively remove most of the bird breeding habitat on Alcatraz, as the birds rely on undisturbed habitat to successfully raise young, • increase disturbance to all species of breeding waterbirds in any remaining habitat, • and, the Model Industries and Laundry Building areas in particular are very high density bird areas and the only location of some breeding species (e.g., Pelagic Cormorants, Black Oystercatchers).
241	L	<p>Marine Zone: Alternative 3 does propose a Historic Immersion Zone with no access within 1000' of the island, delineated by buoys which would potentially protect seabird colonies from marine-based disturbance (boats, kayaks, jet skis, etc). However, if on-island uses are allowed as proposed in earlier sections of Alternative 3. this would preclude the formation of any seabird colonies during the breeding season and thus marine-based protection would be pointless from a natural resources standpoint.</p>
241	L	<p>Other Comments: • We find that none of the alternatives as presently described will meet the Park Service mandate to adequately protect both cultural and natural resources on the Island.</p>
241	L	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The introduction of food service and overnight accommodations to the island would likely have significant negative affects on bird nesting, roosting, foraging behavior, survival.
241	L	<p>Opening the Parade Ground, Laundry Building, Model Industries Building, Agave Trail, Lower Walkways, the walkway below Barker Beach, and the Greenhouse Gardens to increased visitor use will have significant impacts on bird populations, including the exclusion of important breeding colonies from Alcatraz Island.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seasonal closures such as those already in place are an important tool for managing mixed use areas and should be considered for all revised access and maintenance activities. • Human access by tourists and maintenance to sensitive natural resource areas (seabird breeding colonies) should be prevented during the months of February September. • Conservation of seabirds in the marine zone could be improved if the 300 foot sensitive area was defined as a no-use zone during the months of February September. • Reinstalling a line of historic buoys circling the island to prohibit boat traffic near the island (particularly the western shore), would reduce disturbance to seabird colonies.

245	E	<p>Thank you for the opportunity to respond to the present draft general management plan for the GGNRA. This communication consists of several parts. We will first respond to your question #2, and tie in our answers to question #1 — and to: "Why these ideas are most important" — to our specific STAR ALLIANCE Foundation proposal for the "Ring of Understanding" over Alcatraz. Of course there is no reason that values from each of the three proposed alternatives cannot be integrated into an overall master plan, emphasizing in application some values more prominently in some sites, and some values more prominently in others, while honoring all.</p>
245	E	<p>Park Service Question #2): Are there any important elements/ideas that the planning team missed in the preliminary alternatives?</p> <p>STAR ALLIANCE Foundation response: Proposed Alternative #1 for Alcatraz Island, while conceptually excellent in many respects, may not be sufficient to allow fully for the bold proposed structure: "The Ring of Peaceful Understanding," conceived to "hover" in the air space over the main prison. A version of the following abbreviated description was sent in early July by e-mail to the fourteen-hundred members of Architects, Designers and Planners for Social Responsibility, Northern California Chapter.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > The STAR ALLIANCE Foundation of Berkeley has been dedicated since > 1985 to promoting "Universal Peace Ethics" in a variety of ways, > including a "Citizens' Declaration of Highest Common Ideals" for > peace. (www.STARALLIANCE.org).

245	E	<p>STAR ALLIANCE is proposing to the United States National Park Service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > a major monument over Alcatraz to beautify the island and the Bay Area, to improve visitor experiences, and to make an important symbolic statement in support of timeless values. > In its purest sense, except for the footprint of its legs, the monument is conceived to occupy only air space above the prison. We feel this is an ideal opportunity to make an aesthetic and symbolic improvement of global/universal proportions with minimal disruption to the island's natural habitat, while remaining consistent with historic Native American sympathies and important elements of both conservative and progressive values generally. > > As conceived first in early 2001: "The Ring of Understanding" would in effect "hover" over the prison on five flying-arch legs surrounding the main prison block. It would provide spectacular, unobstructed, elevated 360-degree views of the Bay Area far superior and complementary to present view opportunities from the island. At the same time the Ring would serve as a magnificent, elegant pedestal for statuary of up to thirty human figures (prominently including Native Americans) gathered around the roof of the ring, representing the diversity of humankind — eyes and arms raised in a handclasp of joyful unity and solidarity "in commitment to Our Highest Common Ideals." > The ideals or "Primary Peace Principles" would be represented as a column of some thirty stars splayed out at the top, rising above the center of The Ring with Planet Earth at mid-column. Meeting, display, and restaurant space might be housed inside The Ring interior to a
-----	---	---

245	E	<p>The following phrases culled from preliminary overall planning alternative #1, struck us as particularly important in today's global social environment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reaching out Engaging the community Attracting and welcoming people Connecting people [and] large...population(s) Promoting understanding, enjoyment, preservation and health — all as ways to reinvigorate the human spirit. "Parks to the people" Actively seek [to respond to] diversity of visitors Encourage visitors... Enhance outreach and access... welcoming. Foster visitors' deep personal connection to the park Encourage hands-on stewardship through visitor opportunities that promote personal health and responsibility Maximize adaptive reuse...to support visitor enjoyment, understanding and community connections Work with interested groups and populations to manage cultural resources Deepen visitor understanding.
-----	---	--

245	E	<p>Phrases from Alternative #2 that struck us as particularly important:</p> <p>Intentionally connecting resources and systems to form contiguous habitat</p> <p>Manage low-impact visitor use [Our note: This can be accomplished partly by concentrating high-impact visitor use. Furthermore, in the case of The Ring, many more visitors than actually go to the island could enjoy it from a distance, often on a daily basis, and via media, etc..]</p> <p>Integrity</p> <p>Resiliency</p> <p>Promote partnerships</p> <p>Phrases from Alternative #3 that struck us as particularly important:</p> <p>Highest level of preservation to protect their value in perpetuity. [With the Ring representing the culturally evolved present and future, the prison's counterpoint symbolic value will be preserved even as the structure(s) continue to crumble.]</p>
-----	---	---

245	E	<p>Park Service Question: "WHY" are these most important?</p> <p>To answer this question we may borrow from a STAR ALLIANCE Foundation description of "The Challenge of Peace" in today's world.</p> <p>Universal Need. There is an intense need for peaceful, individual and social integration worldwide, marked by stark inequities in economic, legal, political, and educational status and opportunities leading to widespread dissatisfaction, crime and violence, including terrorism and environmental degradation affecting everyone.</p> <p>Fulfilling the needs for peaceful social integration and healthy human progress is vital to the preservation of our common home, Planet Earth; to safety, fulfillment and happiness for all.</p> <p>In an age of nuclear weaponry and proliferation, terrorism and potential environmental and economic collapse; allowing any social element to remain chronically isolated and disaffected courts unacceptable, continuing danger and unnecessary waste of critical resources needed for everyone's higher, more lasting interests.</p>
-----	---	--

245	E	<p>A “STAR ALLIANCE” Response. Responding to “The Challenge of Peace” since 1985, The STAR ALLIANCE Foundation acts as a catalyst to “do less and accomplish more” by stimulating human beings to a higher level of ethical mutual behavior and appreciation — to more efficient and effective conflict resolution, transformation and achievements for common advancement everywhere.</p> <p>A Virtually Unlimited Potential “Market.” To this end the Foundation reaches out to virtually everyone. Regardless of origin, current viewpoint and level of responsibility; individuals are invited to study, discuss, understand and commit (or reinforce existing commitments) to universal “core values.” United in this common commitment; individual people, governments, businesses, institutions and communities — including those in need of extra support and rehabilitation — can and will find transformative energies and resources unlocked to achieve healthier conservative and progressive goals in better balance.</p> <p>It would seem obvious that Alcatraz island, situated prominently as it is at the world-renowned Golden Gate, represents a set of critical opportunities for the United States of America — historic torchbearer of democracy for the world — to rehabilitate and maintain its global leadership position and role for peace, responsible freedom and planetary stewardship.</p>
-----	---	---

<p>245</p>	<p>E</p>	<p>A bold new national monument at Alcatraz, "The Ring of Peaceful Understanding" — will stand in symbolic counterpoint to an aging historic monument to crime, suffering and isolation. The Ring will reach out and welcome visitors from a great distance to a celebration of core values for successful global integration in peace. It will add an important new layer of history to the island pointing to an evolved future, while illuminating the lesser-evolved, historic layers that have come before and the natural basis of all: the land and surrounding waters. It will attract and welcome people and connect them to each other and to their collective pasts; to their more evolved presents (and "presence"); and point to a shared future of universal values for freedom and democracy. It will promote human understanding, a sense of personal responsibility and much sheer enjoyment. In all these ways it will reinvigorate the human spirit. It will be the "highest and best use" of a naturally spectacular physical and social pedestal on Alcatraz, giving superior meaning to the concept of "Parks for the People." It will enhance and complement the Golden Gate Bridge and add importantly to the "Golden Gate Experience." It will enhance views greatly — both from and to the island — over far distances, and in this way reach far more people on a daily basis.</p> <p>The West Coast has an important, established pioneering role in United States and world history. Drawing on its historic distinction as site of the "first West Coast lighthouse," Alcatraz will become an important lighthouse for the future of shared values in peace.</p>
		<p>In regard to the three proposed future plans for Alcatraz Island. The Alcatraz Alumni Association Inc and as a former resident would like to offer the following comments. We strongly support removing the rubble from the Parade ground and opening this area to foot traffic. We support concentrating the birds nesting on the Western side of the island. We strongly support redeveloping the Social Hall for use as the Alcatraz Alumni Museum including the two lane bowling alley and snack bar on the lower floor with full auditorium and commercial kitchen on the main floor. We support refurbishing industries buildings for gatherings, meetings. Class rooms museum and displays including kitchen. We support refurbishing apartments in 64 building for use as a center piece, multi purpose facility to include overnight Hotel lodging, Post Office, Canteen, class rooms, administrative offices, etc. We support using the kitchen of the cell house for use of overnight lodging. If there is to be a hotel on Alcatraz, we would support the rebuilding of A.B and C buildings for use as a hotel. The outer facade and interior should be a historic</p>

42P	P	I simply want to say that adding ANY kind of hotel or inn would utterly ruin the experience of the visitor to Alcatraz. The visitor is supposed to get a feeling of what it was like on the island for those who were imprisoned there. They shouldn't have access to snacks and lodging. For goodness sake does every national park site have to be snack and lodging ready!? Some places should just be preserved for day-time visits and that is all. If people want to spend more time on Alcatraz they can come back the next day and following one after that. A hotel is a mistake.
44P	P	Concerning Alcatraz island, I believe the ideas in Alternative 2 to let more of the island go into a natural state, and to emphasize the important geographic position of the island in terms of ecology are wonderful ideas.
44P	P	3. Concerning Alcatraz island, I do not like the idea found in Alternative 1 of putting a hotel on the island. The island sits in the middle of the bay, and all of us in the Bay Area see it on a regular basis. It belongs to all of us, not just those who could afford to pay for a night at the hotel.
97, 93, 106, 107, 99, 87, 94, 140, 81, 96, 151, 95	P	I urge you to design and build the proposed Alcatraz Island overnight facilities and food service in an environmentally friendly and sustainable manner, which restricts wildlife from accessing human food and trash/waste.