

Table 2: Alternatives Comparison

No-Action Alternative	Preferred Alternative	Alternative A	Alternative B	Alternative C
Overall Vision				
Reflects current conditions and activities	Lakeshore valued primarily for preservation of its natural resources and for opportunities for visitor enjoyment of natural, cultural, and recreational resources in a scenic outdoor setting.	Lakeshore valued primarily for conservation of its natural resources.	Lakeshore valued primarily for its recreational opportunities in scenic outdoor settings.	Lakeshore managed so most visitor use is in select, concentrated areas with more natural, primitive conditions promoted elsewhere.
Provides a baseline for comparing the other alternatives				
Management Zones				
No-action alternative is not zoned.	<div><div>■ high use - 3%</div><div>□ exp history - 5%</div><div>▨ recreation - 25%</div><div>▩ exp nature - 67%</div></div>	<div><div>■ high use - 1%</div><div>□ exp history - 5%</div><div>▨ recreation - 19%</div><div>▩ exp nature - 74%</div></div>	<div><div>■ high use - 4%</div><div>□ exp history - 5%</div><div>▨ recreation - 56%</div><div>▩ exp nature - 35%</div></div>	<div><div>■ high use - 4%</div><div>□ exp history - 5%</div><div>▨ recreation - 25%</div><div>▩ exp nature - 66%</div></div>
Wilderness				
30,903 acres (43%) (from the 1981 “Wilderness Recommendation”) ”	32,200 acres (46%)	33,600 acres (47%)	14,400 acres (20%)	23,200 acres (32%)
Includes areas on North Manitou and South Manitou islands, north and south portions of mainland, some county road rights-of-way	Addition of Sleeping Bear plateau; exclusion of developed county road rights-of-way, exclusion of Port Oneida and Cottage Row on North Manitou Island; other minor revisions.	Addition of Sleeping Bear plateau; exclusion of developed county road rights-of-way, exclusion of Port Oneida and Cottage Row on North Manitou Island; other minor revisions.	North Manitou Island areas only; exclusion of Cottage Row.	Addition of Sleeping Bear plateau; exclusion of developed county road rights-of-way, exclusion of Port Oneida and Cottage Row on North Manitou Island, exclusion of areas on South Manitou Island and some areas in north and south portions of mainland.
Natural Resources				
Natural resource management programs continue to emphasize protection of natural resources and processes.				
Not zoned and therefore cannot be directly compared to the other alternatives.	Second largest amount of experience nature zone, which emphasizes natural resource conditions.	Largest amount of experience nature zone, which emphasizes natural resource conditions.	Least amount of experience nature zone, which emphasizes natural resource conditions.	Slightly less of experience nature zone, which emphasizes natural resource conditions, than the preferred alternative.
Not zoned and therefore cannot be directly compared to the other alternatives.	About one-third of Lakeshore in zones where natural resources may be modified to preserve cultural resources or provide recreational opportunities	About one-quarter of Lakeshore in zones where natural resources may be modified to preserve cultural resources or provide recreational opportunities	About two-thirds of Lakeshore in zones where natural resources may be modified to preserve cultural resources or provide recreational opportunities	About one-third of Lakeshore in zones where natural resources may be modified to preserve cultural resources or provide recreational opportunities
Cultural Resources				
Preserve as many historic structures and landscapes as possible.				
Not zoned and therefore cannot be directly compared to the other alternatives.	Historic structures and landscapes managed as specified by management zone (some treatments are accomplished, some are proposed).			
<b>Note:</b> Percentages below, referring to numbers of historic structures, are based on a total of 262 structures (detailed in table 20); some treatments are accomplished, some are proposed.				
70% preserved, rehabilitated, or restored	79% preserved, rehabilitated, or restored	69% preserved, rehabilitated, or restored	74% preserved, rehabilitated, or restored	79% preserved, rehabilitated, or restored
21% preserved or rehabilitated	13% preserved or rehabilitated	3% preserved or rehabilitated	16% preserved or rehabilitated	15% preserved or rehabilitated
9% preserved	8% preserved	28% preserved	10% preserved	6% preserved
Visitor Orientation				
Information, interpretation, and educational opportunities at Empire visitor center, Glen Haven, and South Manitou Island visitor contact station				
Interpretive activities at major visitor use areas				
A variety of interpretive and educational programs would continue.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action, except that interpretive opportunities would emphasize natural resource themes.	Same as no-action.	More structured interpretive opportunities offered in concentrated use areas and more self-guided opportunities offered elsewhere.
On South Manitou island, concession-operated farm tours would continue.	Same as no-action.	Vehicle portion of farm tours on South Manitou Island ends at west end of Chicago Road (NPS portion of loop road restored to natural conditions). Tours would continue on foot from road end.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action.
No concession auto tours to the Giant Cedars.	Concession auto tours to near Giant Cedars considered.	Same as no-action.	Concession auto tours to near Giant Cedars considered.	Concession auto tours to near Giant Cedars considered.

No-Action Alternative	Preferred Alternative	Alternative A	Alternative B	Alternative C
Visitor Facilities, Opportunities, and Activities				
Road access remains essentially the same.	Road access remains essentially the same; all developed county roads zoned compatible with motor vehicle and bicycle use.	Road access remains essentially the same, except NPS-owned Tiesma Road and a portion of the farm loop on South Manitou Island are closed and restored to natural conditions; all developed county roads zoned compatible with motor vehicle and bicycle use.	Road access remains essentially the same, except scenic road would eventually be built in Benzie Corridor; all county road rights-of-way zoned compatible with motor vehicle and bicycle use.	Same as preferred alternative.
Trails remain essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except add M-22/M-109 hike/bike trail, bay-to-bay hike/paddle trail, and Bow Lakes trail.	Same as preferred alternative.	Same as no-action, except add M-22/M-109 hike/bike trail, bay-to-bay hike/paddle trail, Bow Lakes trails, possible groomed ski trails, and bike lane/trail along Benzie Corridor scenic road.	Same as no-action, except add M-22/M-109 hike/bike trail, bay-to-bay hike/paddle trail, possible trails near Little Glen Lake in the high use zone, Bow Lakes trail, and Benzie Corridor nonmotorized hike/bike trail.
Campgrounds remain essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except add backcountry campgrounds associated with bay-to-bay trail; remove Valley View campground; and provide new designated campgrounds on North Manitou Island.	Same as no-action, except add backcountry campgrounds associated with bay-to-bay trail and remove Valley View campground.	Same as no-action, except add backcountry campgrounds associated with bay-to-bay trail; relocate D. H. Day group campground, and provide new designated campgrounds to replace dispersed camping on North Manitou Island.	Same as no-action, except relocate D. H. Day group campground; add amenities and/or capacity at D. H. Day campground and new designated campgrounds on North Manitou Island.
Lake Michigan beach access remains essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except improve parking at end of Esch Road and possibly at Platte River Point.	Same as no-action, except close Tiesma Road (NPS owned).	Same as no-action, except improve parking at Peterson Road and end of Esch Road, and expanded facilities at Platte River Point.	Same as no-action, except expand facilities at ends of County Road 669, Esch Road, and Platte River Point.
Lake Michigan boat access remains essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except allow for study of improved boat access near Platte River Point.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action, except allow for study of improved boat access near Platte River Point.	Same as no-action, except allow for study of improved boat access at the ends of County Road 669, Esch Road, and near Platte River Point.
Inland lake use and access remains essentially the same (motorized boats allowed on School, Bass-Leelanau County, North Bar, and Loon lakes).	Same as no-action, except no longer allow motorized boats on Bass Lake (Leelanau County) and North Bar Lake; improve access for nonmotorized boats at some inland lakes.	Same as no-action, except no longer allow motorized boats on Bass Lake (Leelanau County).	Same as no-action, except allow motorized boats at Shell and Tucker lakes; improve access at a few inland lakes.	Same as no-action, except improve access at a few inland lakes.
Picnic areas remain essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except upgrade Glen Lake picnic area facilities.	Same as no-action, except remove Glen Lake picnic area and restore site to natural conditions.	Same as no-action, except upgrade a few picnic areas.	Same as no-action, except upgrade/expand Glen Lake picnic area facilities.
Ferry service for day and overnight stays on South Manitou Island and overnight stays on North Manitou Island would continue.	Same as no-action, plus allow occasional ferry service for day trips to North Manitou Island.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action, plus allow occasional ferry service for day trips to North Manitou Island.	Same as no-action.
Platte and Crystal river access areas remain essentially the same.	Same as no-action, except upgrade or relocate Crystal River access area.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action, except upgrade or relocate Crystal River access area.	Same as no-action.
Dune Climb would remain essentially the same.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action.	Upgrade Dune Climb facilities.
Bicycle use allowed on roads used by motor vehicles.	Same as no-action, plus conduct evaluations for expanded bicycle use in zones that permit it.	Same as no-action, plus conduct evaluations for expanded bicycle use in zones that permit it.	Same as no-action, plus conduct evaluations for expanded bicycle use in zones that permit it; consider bicycle rentals on South Manitou Island.	Same as no-action, plus conduct evaluations for expanded bicycle use in zones that permit it.
Hang gliding would continue at designated sites.	Same as no-action.	Hang gliding use at Empire Bluffs suspended.	Same as no-action.	Same as no-action.
Some areas crowded or degraded by overuse.	User capacity management strategies implemented to reduce crowding and protect resources, as needed.			
Benzie Corridor				
Continue to purchase lands on a willing-seller basis for future development of scenic road and bike lane/trail; current conditions (nothing built); no construction costs are included in cost estimates; no impacts are assessed.	Continue to purchase lands on a willing-seller basis for future development of scenic road and/or a hike/bike trail (nothing built within life of plan); no construction costs are included in cost estimates; no impacts are assessed.	Recommend removal of Benzie Corridor from Lakeshore boundary (nothing built); no construction costs are included in cost estimates; general impacts of removing the corridor from Lakeshore boundary are assessed.	Continue to purchase lands on a willing-seller basis for development of scenic road and bike lane/trail (built within life of plan); construction costs are included in cost estimates; general impacts are assessed in this document.	Continue to purchase lands on a willing-seller basis for development of nonmotorized hike/bike trail (built within life of plan); construction costs are included in cost estimates; general impacts are assessed in this document.
Bow Lakes				
Continue nature observation and backcountry hiking on informal, undesignated trails .	Construct a loop trail and small parking area.	Same as preferred alternative.	Construct a multi-loop trail and small parking area.	Same as preferred alternative.
The National Park Service would acquire properties within this area of the Lakeshore, on a willing-seller basis, as they become available (subject to available funding).				
Estimated “Full-time Equivalent” Staff*				
66	79	77	79	85
Estimated Cost in Millions*				
\$22.0	\$32.9	\$29.8	\$58.2	\$45.9

\* For more information see “Appendix C: Cost Summary of GMP Alternatives”