



WASHINGTON-ROCHAMBEAU REVOLUTIONARY ROUTE STUDY

RESPONSE TO PUBLIC COMMENTS - SEPTEMBER 2007

Where a person is writing on behalf of a private or governmental organization, or uses official stationary of an organization, the person's title and organization are noted. Some comments are summarized for brevity, others are direct quotes. Note: Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route in some comments abbreviated as "W3R"

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
1.	Kim Burdick National Chairman W3R-USA	<p>This is an excellent legacy project for the current administration. It is educational, patriotic, environmentally sound, requires NO takings and has vast grassroots support in the most densely populated part of the whole United States.</p> <p>Please get this legislation passed with fiscal note attached as soon as possible.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
2.	Kevin Vincent Virginia Coordinator W3R-VA	<p>I wholeheartedly support the NPS recommendation that the W3R be designated as a National Historic Trail.</p> <p>As suggested in the study, I strongly encourage NPS to "evaluate other historic routes which are integral to the W3R and larger Yorktown Campaign, [specifically] the movements of General Lafayette's and Cornwallis' troops in Virginia coincident with the marches of Washington and Rochambeau."</p> <p>Important to identify and create connecting and side trails in Virginia in order to give a more accurate picture of the Yorktown Campaign.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<p>Concerned about accuracy of route mapping.</p> <p>Suggested other miscellaneous revisions or additions to study.</p> <p>Pg. 72: there is a photograph captioned “John News Ordinary, Virginia.” I am unaware of any building by this name in Virginia.</p> <p>Pg. 72: refers to “Pohick Church, near Fredericksburg.” Pohick Church is actually closer to Alexandria than Fredericksburg.</p>	<p>revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p> <p>The building pictured was built in the late 18th century as a roadside tavern or ordinary. Today, the Botetourt Building is the home of the Gloucester Museum of History and Visitor Information.</p> <p>This item has been corrected via errata.</p>
3.	<p>Mary Donovan, Ph.D. President</p> <p>Richard Borkow, MD Trustee</p> <p>Dobbs Ferry Historical Society, NY</p>	<p>The NPS received comments from representatives of the Dobbs Ferry Historical Society.</p> <p>The Society asked that Dobbs Ferry be included on trail maps.</p> <p>The Society also provided additional comments on the report. In summary, these included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To provide additional emphasis in the report maps and narrative regarding the role of Dobbs Ferry and its surrounding areas as the beginning point of the march to Yorktown. The Society provides a number of references regarding troop movements, headquarters and encampments in the area of Dobbs Ferry. 	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>In addition to being identified on the Historic Map, Dobbs Ferry is also identified on the Detailed Map located in the study.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. The place name “Philipsburg” be changed to its modern name “Greenburgh.” 3. Dobbs Ferry should be “certified as a key site in the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route Study.” 4. Suggested other miscellaneous revisions or additions to study. 	<p>routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p> <p>This item has been corrected via errata.</p> <p>Pg. 35 of the study identifies NPS certification of sites and their preservation as a possible means to set standards to be practiced in the trail’s management.</p> <p>While Dobbs Ferry played an important role as a Revolutionary War crossing point, the Society’s comments themselves recognize that a much larger geographic area was involved as headquarter sites, encampments and points of departure for the march to Yorktown.</p>
4.	Howard A. Mayo, Jr. , President Continental Congress Chapter Sons of the American Revolution	Constituent through Congressman Todd R. Platts: Please support the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route.	Thank you for your comments.
5.	Ralph Nelson Sons of the American Revolution	<p>I support the development of the W3R as a National Historic Trail because it provides strong support for publicizing and interpreting the W3R as a regional resource with international significance.</p> <p>Please present the case for development of the W3R as a NHT to Congress with the facts, assessments, illustrations, and enthusiasm that shine so well through the report.</p>	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
6.	Steven F. DeRochi Chairman Montgomery Township Landmarks Commission County of Somerset, NJ	<p>This trail will pass through a scenic part of our Township, linking a number of our open spaces into a cohesive pathway system. We believe that our part of the Trail can be implemented at minimum cost to the Government, in that much of it already exists in conservation easements and conserved lands within our Township.</p> <p>If there is anything proactive that we can do to support the trail, we would like to be part of it.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
7.	Susan R. Kirkpatrick	<p>Act quickly to encourage preservation of the few Revolutionary War sites that have not already been developed and to mark their importance.</p> <p>I hope you proceed with this project in its most comprehensive form.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
8.	N. Ray and Judith Hester	<p>This is a wonderful project; it deserves the full support of every American.</p> <p>The work of the last 8 years has brought the historians and “history buffs” of Eastern America together like never before.</p> <p>There is a working network in place to support a continuation of the work as a National Historic Trail.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
9.	James. E. Pileggi Sons of the American Revolution	<p>I am very impressed with the work of this commission in compiling and presenting a large volume of information in a very readable fashion.</p> <p>The past attempts to educate and preserve on the local and state level the W3R have not been well coordinated and poorly funded.</p>	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
10.	<p>William J. Opferman Board Member Property Rights Foundation of America</p>	<p>Concerned that previously submitted petitions containing opposing comments about the proposed National Historic Trail, received by the National Park Service in 2002, were not mentioned in the study.</p> <p>The proposed NHT violates the 10th Amendment to the US Constitution, also Article 1. Sec 8 of the US Constitution.</p> <p>I still stand opposed to establishment of Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route as a NPS NHT, which can lead to establishment of United Nations UNESCO International Biosphere Reserves and World Heritage Sites!</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>All comments received during the course of the study were carefully reviewed by the study team. Pg. 8 of the study acknowledges this concern: “Some citizens are concerned that action could affect private property rights.”</p> <p>The National Park Service conducted the study in response to congressional direction and does not agree that the establishment of National Historic Trails violates the 10th amendment.</p> <p>The establishment of most national historic trails has not required federal acquisition of any land. Any action resulting from this study must respect private property rights while protecting the rights of the public to access and enjoy public lands. National Historic Trails have not led to the establishment of U.S. Biosphere Reserves and none are currently designated as World Heritage Sites.</p>
11.	<p>Barbara A. Brown Commissioner Parks & Recreation Town Commissioners of Perryville, MD</p>	<p>I agree fully with the recommendations made that will lead to this being a national route under the auspices of the National Park Service.</p> <p>The Rogers Tavern, a National Register Property, is shown on pg. 72 of the study. In the photo caption, the name is misspelled. There is no apostrophe.</p> <p>If funding opportunities for signage, interpretative displays, etc., were to become available, it would be an added plus.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>This item has been corrected via errata.</p>
12.	<p>Trent Margrif Preservation Delaware Wilmington, DE</p>	<p>We strongly support Alternative B with W3R authorized and designated by Congress as a National Historic Trail.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<p>We find the specific information to Delaware in this report to be accurate and important in advancing our statewide preservation efforts.</p> <p>The NHT designation will help increase heritage tourism and assist in advancing historic preservation efforts and general education.</p>	
13.	<p>Carolyn F. Mathias Regent Head of Elk Chapter National Society Daughters of the American Revolution</p>	<p>In complete support of the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route.</p> <p>It is very gratifying to see our heritage being preserved and at the same time giving recognition to Elk Landing and Rodgers Tavern located in Cecil County, MD.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
14.	<p>Requested that name be withheld</p>	<p>A fine and fair assessment.</p> <p>A portion of the middle and upper Potomac River is missing or incorrectly rendered. Depiction of the routes in such “broad brush” rendering over the base map sacrifices the readability of the terrain features and actual location of camp-sites.</p> <p>To my knowledge the POHIC site did not exist neither as a “march”, nor as a “camp.” If there was indeed a campsite at Pohick crossing, it would be named “POHICK.”</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p> <p>The spelling of POHIC (pg. 24) has been corrected via errata.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
15.	Robert Giovanelli	<p>Concerned about notification of public meetings held in 2002.</p> <p>Concerned that opposing comments about the proposed National Historic Trail, received by the National Park Service in 2002, were not mentioned in the study.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The NPS distributed a press release on February 27, 2002 announcing three regional public meetings for the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route. The press release identified the following locations for the scheduled meetings: Hartford, CT, Yorktown, VA and Trenton, NJ. Subsequent individual press releases were sent out detailing the date, time and location for each meeting.</p> <p>The opposing comments submitted during the study were carefully reviewed by the study team. Pg. 8 of the study acknowledges this concern: “Some citizens are concerned that action could affect private property rights.” See also response to comment #10.</p>
16.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>The study more than adequately details this particular segment of our Nations history.</p> <p>I support this plan finding little to criticize.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
17.	James K. Burr 5 th NY Regiment	<p>Recognition of Historical events and places cannot happen if they are all someday paved over or otherwise disjointed.</p> <p>Fervent hope that the WRRR Historical Route be designated and nationally recognized as such.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
18.	Virginia A. Laper	<p>Comte de Rochambeau spent one night, December 7, 1782, in the Hasbrouck House at Newburgh, NY. This was General George Washington’s Headquarters in the Hudson Valley during the Revolutionary War.</p> <p>Please designate the Hasbrouck House as part of the route.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>Hasbrouck House is identified in Appendix B: Route Resources of the study. (Pg. 138)</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
19.	Robert Hutchinson Philipstown Greenway Committee, NY	<p>The map identified as Fig. 4.3 shows the Eastern Highlands portion of the route of the Continental Army’s march from Verplanck’s Point to New Windsor on 26-28 October 1782, as lying entirely to the west of Route 9 running parallel to the east bank of the Hudson River from Peekskill north to West Point. I contend that the route of the Continental Army on the 26th and 27th of October 1782, instead lay predominantly on the east side of Route 9, as much as 8 miles east of the route depicted.</p> <p>Recommends adding sites along the latter route, all located in the Town of Philipstown, to be considered as candidates for addition to the List of Sites on the W3R in New York.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
20.	Eric F. Nelson Planning Department City of Fredericksburg, VA	<p>City strongly supports Alternative B.</p> <p>Recommended updating Appendix B: Route Resources to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • George Washington’s Boyhood Home at Ferry Farm • Hunter’s Iron Works • Kenmore (home of George Washington’s sister) <p>Consideration should also be given to recognizing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mary Washington House (George Washington’s mother’s house) • Lewis Store where GW had an account. <p>Suggested other miscellaneous revisions or additions to the study.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
21.	William L. Wienecke 5 th NY Regiment	To preserve the memory of the Soldiers of the Revolution, it is only fitting that we commit the proposed resources to preserve the historic Washington-Rochambeau trail. I completely endorse this plan so that our posterity might never forget an essential piece of our national heritage.	Thank you for your comments.
22.	Winchell S. Carroll President W3R-PA	On behalf of the officers and directors of the W3R in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, we support Alternative B - the establishing of the W3R National Historic Trail. Thanks again for an excellent report.	Thank you for your comments.
23.	Harry Boeselager	Opposed to Alternative B. Concerned that opposing comments about the proposed National Historic Trail, received by the National Park Service in 2002, were not mentioned in the study.	Thank you for your comments. The previously submitted comments were carefully reviewed by the study team. Pg. 8 of the study acknowledges this concern: "Some citizens are concerned that action could affect private property rights." See also response to comment #10.
24.	Hans DePold Bolton Town Historian, CT	Bolton, CT supports the route as a NHT. The trail does not commemorate a battle, but the journey that France and the United States took together as social freedom and national democracy first emerged.	Thank you for your comments.
25.	John M. Dubis	I hope that the NPS does NOT go with the "do nothing" approach.	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
26.	Katharine F. Thompson	<p>I favor Alternative A.</p> <p>I am concerned that Congress would regard this project as part of overall expenditures on the park system which is under-funded.</p> <p>Considering the state of the nation’s finances, Alternative B seems an untimely use of taxpayer funds.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>Funding for the National Trail System is a separate line item from funding for units of the National Park System.</p>
27.	Sallie T. de Barcza Chairman W3R-NJ	<p>We strongly support the creation of a NHT along the W3R</p> <p>We find the “No action” conclusion on page 95, that there would be “no significant impact” to be a direct contradiction of the preceding section of the report which correctly identifies irreversible damage, incompatible development, limited opportunities, resource deterioration and loss of integrity as a consequence of no action.</p> <p>Consider recognizing the return march after the victory at Yorktown such as the 55 identified campsites and bivouacs mentioned on page 85.</p> <p>Revise maps on pgs. 47-48 to reflect Dr. Selig’s New Jersey report.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>An “effect” for purposes of Section 106 is determined by a federal undertaking. That does not mean that there are not existing adverse conditions that will continue or occur in the future that will have an "adverse effect" if the federal government has no undertaking (takes “no action”). Those adverse conditions, for purposes of an EA, are not the result of the option of Federal “no action,” but rather the consequences of a lack of state or local regulatory capabilities.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
28.	Lanny R. Patten President Philadelphia-Continental Chapter Sons of the American Revolution	This Chapter strongly endorses the Study’s Alternative B to mark this route as a National Historic Trail within the National Trails System.	Thank you for your comments.
29.	Andler L. Alexander	Heartily supports the project. There will be many benefits derived from this effort, not the least in family outings, the opportunity to walk in the tracks of the heroes that helped our nation survive that eight year struggle.	Thank you for your comments.
30.	Requested that name be withheld	As a member of the Daughters of the American Revolution, this Revolutionary Route is very important to our Society. With NPS recognition of this very historic route, our Society would promote and support visits along the route. Thank you for all you have done to identify the people and places.	Thank you for your comments.
31.	Requested that name be withheld	The W3R trail will help in great measure to restore and preserve the historic sites along the trail for future generations to enjoy as well as offering them to a much greater public than is now possible. I vote for B – the National Historic Trail	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
32.	<p>Christopher Rennie President Major Robert Kirkwood Chapter Delaware Society, Sons of the American Revolution</p>	<p>I believe this study is the most important historical study undertaken in recent memory.</p> <p>Establishing a NHT for the W3R route will greatly promote and support hundreds of historical sites along the entire length of the route. That will in turn promote business and boost the economy in several states. A NHT will support old and promote new American Revolutionary educational programs for hundreds of school districts and thousands of school children.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
33.	<p>Carol P. Howerton State Chairman: W3R Committee of the Virginia Daughters of the American Revolution</p>	<p>The VA DAR funded and had constructed the replacement of the “W3R to Victory” Display signs located at the entrance to Mount Vernon and on the Yorktown Battlefield in Colonial National Park.</p> <p>The study is a compilation of years of intensive research. The product is outstanding. It is certainly recommended that the outcome will be the declaration and establishment by Congress of this route as a national historic trail designation.</p> <p>What a wonderful patriotic route this could be to lead Americans to truly appreciate the courageous efforts of the Patriots in obtaining the freedoms we have enjoyed for centuries.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
34.	<p>Ellan W. Thorson Ann Arundel Chapter Daughters of the American Revolution</p>	We need to remind our countrymen, young and old, about our history and a trail designation will help do that.	Thank you for your comments.
35.	Requested that name be withheld	Supports the W3R NHT proposal that the National Park Service has recently reported to the nation.	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<p>Trust concurs with the no adverse effects evaluation of Alternative B.</p> <p>Trust is enthusiastic that this designation will act as catalyst for continued preservation and sustainability of resources resulting from interpretive programming and heritage tourism opportunities which will positively impact cultural resources associated with this NHT designation.</p>	
39.	<p>Edward F. Sanderson Executive Director Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer, RI</p>	<p>Concurs with the findings of the report because it has major significance for RI and for the nation. Would be pleased to see consideration by Congress for national historic trail designation.</p> <p>Suggested other miscellaneous revisions or additions to the study specific to Appendix B: Route Resources.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p> <p>Technical mistakes corrected via errata.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
40.	Richard N. Platt, Jr. City Historian Milford, CT	A hearty endorsement of the creation of the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route NHT to commemorate a pivotal moment in the independence of the United States.	Thank you for your comments.
41.	Martin C. Aronchick President North Salem Historical Society, NY	Supports establishing a route as in Alternative B. Coordination among the various jurisdictions through which the W3R passes is necessary to enhance public awareness. Route goes through North Salem; however, its overriding significance to all Americans is what merits the National Trail designation.	Thank you for your comments.
42.	Patricia H. Morianos Bolton Historical Society, CT	We must protect our history by telling the most accurate story by continuing to research to the best of our ability. The Town is committed to preservation of the land and its history. Purchased the Rose Farm. April 20 th , 2007 I presented to speaker Nancy Pelosi a letter of support signed by all our constitutional officers, selectmen, State Reps. and U.S. Reps. DeLauro and Larson. This bill is well supported and I hope your report will reflect that.	Thank you for your comments.
43.	Dorothy P. Guzzo Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer, NJ	NJHPO supports the finding of the report that the route meets the criteria of significance for designation as a NHT and NPS's preferred Alternative B which would result in a designation of the entire length of the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route as a NHT.	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<p>We concur with the no adverse effects evaluation of Alternative B.</p> <p>The NPS should assist states in the endeavor through the preparation of a Multiple Property Documentation Form for this resource.</p>	<p>The study team has passed your suggestion along to the National register staff.</p>
44.	Scott Livingston	<p>It would be wonderful to see NPS involvement so that this NHT can link together the disparate efforts of many.</p> <p>Support Alternative B, and hope that whatever efforts are made, they are consistent with strict environmental ethics.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
45.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>Total and unreserved support of W3R-NHT</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
46.	Terri Bagley	<p>Please recognize the Washington Rochambeau Revolutionary Route NHT which runs through the center of Bolton, CT.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
47.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>I urge support of the W3R NHT. A vital part of our nation's history.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
48.	Beth Harney Friends of Rose Farm Bolton, CT	<p>As a founding member of Rose Farm, I wholly support the designation of the Rochambeau Historical Trail.</p> <p>Rose Farm, 103 acres, is the 5th encampment of Rochambeau's troops on their trek from Newport to NY.</p> <p>Formal designation will only enhance our efforts to keep the area intact and preserve the historic, scenic and green community we love.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
49.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>Rochambeau's troops marched by the Rising Sun Inn, in Crownsville, MD, on September 16, 1781 on the way to Yorktown.</p> <p>I wholeheartedly endorse the proposal to make the W3R a NHT.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
50.	James M. Johnson W3R-NY	<p>We strongly urge Congress to designate the W3R as a National Historic Trail as a legacy of the 225th Anniversary of the American Revolution.</p> <p>We applaud the work done by the NPS in producing this historic report.</p> <p>We will do our part to preserve, to interpret, and to memorialize NY section of this nationally significant path to American nationhood. W3R is an opportunity to combine historical and environmental preservation.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
51.	Janice Artemel Director Potomac Heritage Partnership Washington, DC	<p>We support the authorization and designation of the W3R as a NHT within the National Trails System - Preferred Alternative B.</p> <p>We look forward to an opportunity to work with federal, state and local agencies, as well as other organizations in the successful implementation of the trail.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
52.	Susan M. DePold Bolton Historical Society, CT	<p>This route which led to our liberty and to the establishment of our great nation deserves the designation of National Historic Trail.</p> <p>The Town of Bolton is so proud of their well preserved campsite of Rochambeau's Army, that in 2000 we purchased the [Rose] farm where this historic treasure is.</p>	Thank you for your comments.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
53.	Barbara S. Abrahamer Member NY State DOT	<p>The battle is important, the consequences of the battle are important; I find very little about the choice of arrival/departure routes to be important.</p> <p>With each new historical trail designation, the reputations of other historical trails are called into question; designating a trail that does not deserve to be so designated impugns the value of other trails.</p> <p>Concerned about well-meaning cultural groups achieving their marketing goals through the use of highway signs rather than focusing on the aspects of their historical entities that are truly deserving of their attention.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study was required to evaluate the route against established criteria for national historic trails, describe the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, outline potential environmental consequences, and determine if the Route is suitable for designation as a national historic trail. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation.</p>
54.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>One of proposed routes that trace the Continental army moves crosses the Hudson from Dobbs Ferry to Palisades in Rockland County, and then seems to turn south to NJ, just skipping Tappan, NY. I feel very strongly that you ought to consider including Tappan in this project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • American troops returning from Yorktown set a camp in Tappan in 1782, commemorated by a marker. • DeWint House, built in 1700 is probably the oldest structure that served as Washington’s headquarters (August 1780 and in May 1783 to meet with Sir Guy Carleton to discuss the withdrawal of British troops from NYC). • Tappan’s historic sites lie within an 85-acre historic district established by a town ordinance – first law of its kind in a New York State town. 	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
55.	John T. Muro	<p>Supports the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route NHT which is the heart of Bolton, CT. The historic trail should be created this year.</p> <p>The NHT will provide a vehicle and the potential for matching private, local, state, and federal incentives to preserve the remaining open space along the route.</p> <p>This is a gift we owe our children and the many generations that follow.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
56.	Thomas A. Lavalle Tappantown Historical Society, NY	Because the troops camped at Tappan NY on their way back from Yorktown in 1782, please consider including Tappen as part of this project.	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
57.	<p>Mary R. Cardenas Orangetown Historian, NY</p>	<p>Tappan has a lot of history related to the Revolutionary War Period.</p> <p>George Washington stayed in Tappan at the DeWint House on 4 separate occasions: twice in 1780 and twice in 1783.</p> <p>Place of a Continental campsite (1782) set up on the return from the Battle of Yorktown located on a western ridge in Tappan. This is written on a state education marker placed on the site in 1932.</p> <p>Tappen in Orangetown, NY should be given some inclusion in the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
58.	<p>Robert Hoch President White Plains Historical Society, NY</p>	<p>On behalf of the Historical Society, I express my support for the creation of a National Historic Trail to commemorate this momentous and often overlooked military campaign which set into motion Washington's ultimate victory in the struggle for American Independence.</p> <p>The Duc de Lauzan made his 1781 headquarters in what is now downtown White Plains.</p> <p>I would ask that any National Historic Trail designation make benefits and resources available to adjacent communities like White Plains which, while not directly on the proposed trail, did play a role in the historic movement of French and American troops toward Yorktown.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Duc de Lauzan is considered part of Rochambeau's Army for purposes of the study.</p> <p>Specific financial and technical assistance opportunities for resources related to the trail, should it be congressionally designated, will be determined by the comprehensive trail plan.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
59.	Requested that name be withheld	Having the W3R become a NHT would preserve a piece of Revolutionary War history and boost the renaissance of East Hartford.	Thank you for your comments.
60.	Sandra Anderson Regent Ann Arundel Chapter NSDAR	In favor of designating the W3R as a NHT. Our Chapter owns the Rising Sun Inn, a 1753 building, located on the Old Generals Highway in Crownsville on the W3R Important to have this trail to remind us of our alliance with France.	Thank you for your comments.
61.	Jeanne H. Watson Former Executive Director Morris County Historical Society, NJ	I found the NPS report very interesting and enjoyed learning more about plans for this Revolutionary Route, especially the proposed interpretive themes. I do wonder about the route followed by troops as they returned to their homes. Nothing has been included about where they camped during the return march, except that Morristown is marked on one map. It would be interesting to include information about what happened after the British surrender. You might be interested in a story associated with the Trent House in Trenton, NJ because in 1781 and 1782 Rochambeau camped nearby.	Thank you for your comments. The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process. Trent House is identified in Appendix B: Route Resources (Pg. 135)

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
62.	James T. Raleigh	<p>In the hope that a more complete W3R story will follow a favorable recommendation by Congress.</p> <p>The role of the French Bake Ovens in Chatham is an important part of the Washington-Rochambeau story. They were used to feed troops. The study should have mentioned them.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
63.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>The departure of Rochambeau (and others) separate from the main body of the French Troops is an important part of the story.</p> <p>The report is weak on the northbound route and does not give the effect of the British occupation of Savannah and Charlestown much less the British in NY.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
		<p>The maps are all different. Where is the Trail? Look at the routes CT and NJ – Where are these explained? The historic text by Dr. Selig does not appear to be related to the various maps.</p>	<p>revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p> <p>See previous response. The study team has prepared detailed maps and inventories of troop movements on current-day maps. When not specifically described in the narrative, an interpretation of the likely route taken by the troops between campsites or between points of origin and destination has been made by the study team.</p>
64.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>There are several updates that should be provided to the Secretary of Interior. They include the fact that while this study was considering other possible related projects at least two, The Crossroads of the American Revolution and the Captain John Smith (waterway) Trail have been authorized by Congress.</p> <p>Report does not adequately discuss:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. the British Navy and in New York [which] makes it very hard to explain the importance of W3R in world history, much less North American History 2. building on the state studies by Dr. Selig or others and the work of the volunteers over the years; 3. Wethersfield, CT <p>What is important is only to support the need for the trail and further work.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The study team is fully aware of the two designations; one a national heritage area; the other a national historic trail. The Secretary of the Interior transmitted both studies to Congress prior to the congressional designation action.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
65.	Requested that name be withheld	<p>Now we need the story of why Rochambeau and the French stayed in Virginia until July of 1782 - more than nine months and why they chose to return by the same route to Rhode Island and then move the troops to Boston.</p> <p>Why did Rochambeau leave the troops, where did he go and how he was chased by the British. For example in Sussex County there is a village "Lafayette." The State Senator says that the local story says that Lafayette asked that they keep the village without change until he got back and they have not changed in the last 200 years. This village is on Rochambeau's third crossing of New Jersey.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
66.	James Raleigh	<p>Would like to see more details to take the trail from Yorktown to Boston. Recall that the locals had to feed the French and British Navy and in New York have NOT gone away.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
67.	James Raleigh	<p>There appears to be a problem on the Historic Map. Chatham and Springfield have been grouped together. They are in fact on opposite sides of a ridge/gap which was very important in planning the hide/show of the troop movements.</p> <p>Hope you can update the map.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
68.	Scott W. Maits Fairmont Park Caretaker Historic Blue Bell Inn Philadelphia, PA	<p>The Blue Bell Inn, set in Fairmont Park along Cobbs Creek is probably the most significant and historically correct building and setting for W3R. Located in a part of Philadelphia’s gateway to the south and scene of many receptions and start of military escorts.</p> <p>Concerned about accuracy of route mapping.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
69.	Frank S. Jazzo Historian & W3R Committee Town of Greenburgh, NY	Supports a “National Heritage Trail.” In favor of Alternative B Hopes to conduct further investigation into Thirty Dear Ridge, an unincorporated part of Greenburg where it is believed one of the French outposts was established during the Philipsburg encampment.	Thank you for your comments.
70.	Town of Greenburgh, NY	Passed resolution “urging the Secretary of the Interior to present to Congress Alternative B of the National Park Service Study, Recommending that the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route be authorized and designated a National Historic Trail within the National Trails System.”	Thank you for your comments.
71.	Robert J. Stackpole President New York Chapter Sons of the American Revolution	The New York Chapter, owners of the Odell House, Rochambeau’s headquarters, fully supports the NPS recommendation to implement Alternative B. Supplied additional information on the Colonel John Odell House. Suggested miscellaneous revisions and additions to the study.	The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.

#	PERSON COMMENTING	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
72.	Torben Jenk	<p>I am keen that we share and interpret as accurate an historical record as possible, drawn from as many credible sources as possible whether degreed historians looking at the entire campaign or enthusiastic amateurs like myself who can offer specialized knowledge of a particular area.</p> <p>Despite the invective of a few historians, I have thoroughly enjoyed working with the W3R folks and Dr. Bob Selig in particular to continue our best to join with people in neighboring communities along the entire 600 mile route to honor the 225th anniversary of Rochambeau’s march to Yorktown.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The study evaluates the proposed route against established criteria for national historic trails, describes the existing natural, cultural, and socioeconomic resources associated with the route, and outlines potential environmental consequences. The study provides sufficient historic research and adequate mapping based on the parameters set in the enabling legislation to determine the trail meets appropriate criteria for designation. In response to comments regarding the accuracy of maps associated with the march taken by the Continental and French armies; suggested miscellaneous revisions or additions; or requests that specific resources be mentioned in the study, the NPS has not modified the study, the routes or added to the list of resources. If the trail is designated by Congress, your comments will be forwarded to the planning team where they may be more thoroughly evaluated in the comprehensive trail management process.</p>
73.	Mr. Shields	Supports Alternative B – authorizing the Washington-Rochambeau Revolutionary Route as a National Historic Trail.	Thank you for your comments.